

**'Tis (almost) three centuries since.**

## **Linguistic explorations in *The Lyon in Mourning*<sup>1</sup>**

Marina Dossena

This is the song of the sword of Alan;  
The smith made it,  
The fire set it;  
Now it shines in the hand of Alan Breck.

(Robert Louis Stevenson, *Kidnapped*, ch. 10.  
The Siege of the Round-house)

### **1 Introduction**

In historical research, whether concerned with events or, in our case, their linguistic representation, it is always important to ‘listen to the witnesses’. Although the (very likely) subjectivity of these primary sources can be a serious drawback, their usefulness is nonetheless indisputable, and this is especially true for linguists, who may rely on them to study the discourse of support, persuasion, and indeed conflict with the opponents.

For the purposes of this study I considered that 2015 marks three centuries since the Jacobite rising of 1715, and 270 years since ‘the Forty-five’, the year that would leave such an indelible mark on Scottish history, literature, and possibly language. The Union of Parliaments of 1707 had already undermined Scottish opportunities to maintain its specificity in very serious ways, as the centre of political and cultural interest shifted to London. Although the education, religious and juridical systems were maintained, the need to ‘go south’, whether literally or metaphorically, was felt by many who wished to climb the social ladder. After Culloden, the 1746 Act of Proscription<sup>2</sup> further contributed to the ‘standardisation’ of the Highlands, and even in the Lowlands the anglicizing trends that had already begun as early as the Union of the Crowns in 1603 gained new momentum:

---

<sup>1</sup> A preliminary version of this contribution was read at the 2015 FRLSU Conference in Ayr, which – interestingly – is twinned with St Germain en Laye, the suburb of Paris where James VII and II set up his court in 1688, when he was exiled after his defeat against William of Orange.

<sup>2</sup> This is the Act of Parliament which also forbade the use of Highland garb (19 Geo. II, ch. 39, sec. 17, 1746), thus reinforcing previous ‘Disarming Acts’. The laws would not be repealed till 1782.

it is probably no accident that so many grammars and spelling and pronunciation dictionaries were published at this point in time, so as to provide guidance for those who wished to get rid of their 'barbarous, vulgar, provincial' dialect both in speech and in writing. It is true that in Late Modern times the attempt to codify English was in full swing<sup>3</sup>, but in the case of Scotland this attitude took on a more specific colouring (see Dossena 2005).

Within this framework, the documents collected in *The Lyon in Mourning* (Forbes 1746-75 [Paton 1895-96], henceforth LM) seem a very promising source, both in relation to their value as witnesses of Late Modern Scottish English and in relation to their argumentative function. As they are presented as a contemporary 'account of events', in this contribution I aim to discuss how argument and fact coexist in the collection, which was published at the end of the nineteenth century, i.e. at a point in time when the representation of Jacobites had undergone some significant changes. In LM the texts are presented in what appears to be a fairly neutral textual organisation, though the compiler was a Jacobite, and despite a subtitle in which it is clearly stated that the collection was 'as exactly made as the iniquity of the times would permit' (LM: Titlepage). While it could be assumed that contemporary readers were indeed on the same side as the compiler, and therefore did not need to be persuaded, the attempt to collect and preserve documents for posterity implies a larger audience: people who had neither experienced the events nor met witnesses, and who therefore had to be both informed and persuaded of the validity of the arguments at hand simply relying on linguistic and textual strategies.

The collection comprises letters (both familiar and official), dying speeches, journals and accounts, in addition to songs and verse: i.e., text types in which subjectivity and emotional involvement inevitably occur alongside strategies meant to stress factuality and reliability. The diversity of such text types and their random distribution in the collection make quantitative analyses hardly viable within the scope of this contribution; instead, my study will present an overview of the main pragmatic macro-functions that seem to be at work when the aim is to elicit the readers' sympathy and solidarity, while maintaining an overall chronicling style. These will be discussed giving specific attention to theoretical and methodological issues.

---

<sup>3</sup> On this topic see, among others, Tieken-Boon van Ostade (2008) and Beal, Nocera and Sturiale (2008).

## **2 Background notes:**

### **The representation of Jacobites in Late Modern times**

As Jacobitism had been a fraught issue for several decades, it is somewhat predictable that throughout Late Modern times its representation was as polarised as the attitudes it elicited. Opponents stigmatised each other, while idealizing their own side. However, as time passed, important changes began to occur, and new images were formed, as very clearly illustrated by Clyde (1994) in his study of the transformation of the Highlander ‘from rebel to hero’. In more recent years Calloway (2008) has drawn an interesting comparison between the predicament and the representation of Highlanders and of Native Americans: in both cases their ‘defeat’ underpinned cases of ‘imperialist nostalgia’ that led to the idealisation of a now lost past in which former foes were depicted as brave warriors belonging to a world that in the meantime had become irretrievable. While Calloway (2008) presents several instances, the parallelism in such representations is particularly obvious in two paintings: *The Last of the Clan* (1865, by Thomas Faed, currently at the Kelvingrove Art Gallery and Museum in Glasgow) and *Last of their Race* (1857, by John Mix Stanley, currently at the Whitney Western Art Museum in Cody, Wyoming)<sup>4</sup>.

It is undoubted that a remarkable contribution to this change in attitudes was given by the romanticisation of the Highlands of Scotland begun with Macpherson’s *Ossian* and emphasised by Sir Walter Scott and James Hogg long after the Jacobites’ final defeat<sup>5</sup>. In addition, representations of the Scottish diaspora often mixed spontaneous emigration with exile and deportation caused by the Highland Clearances on one hand and actual legal sentences on the other, despite their temporal distance; while the former are (mostly) a later phenomenon, the latter concern the second half of the eighteenth century (see Murdoch 2010 and Richards 2007). Even the title of a song like *Lochaber no more*, the lyrics of which had first appeared in Allan Ramsay’s *Tea Table Miscellany* (1724), and which reflect on the pain of leaving loved ones behind when going to war, was adopted for a painting on leaving home, possibly as emigrants but also as exiles. The 1883 painting, by John Watson Nicol and currently in the Fleming Collection in London, presents an image which is in fact

---

<sup>4</sup> As all the paintings mentioned in this section are easily found online, no images are provided here.

<sup>5</sup> On the progression from ‘Scotophobia’ to ‘Celtomania’ see Sorensen (2000).

metaphorical in its extreme idealisation<sup>6</sup>, but the impact of which is remarkable.

Robert Louis Stevenson's works also gave a dashing, romantic aura to Jacobite characters: Alan Breck Stewart in *Kidnapped* and James Durie in *The Master of Ballantrae* are intriguing figures who often take centre stage and actually steal the scene from the narrating voice. Other Jacobite figures may appear in a slightly less positive light, but this does not detract from the fascination of the stories and their protagonists.

Following these literary successes, popular culture increased its interest in Jacobite landmarks and trails – not only those connected with real-life events such as Glenfinnan, Killicrankie, Prestonpans and of course Culloden and Skye, but also those in which history and fiction blend: it is the case of 'The Stevenson Way'<sup>7</sup>, a trail in the footsteps of David Balfour and Alan Breck Stewart, which is also associated with the well-known (and still officially unsolved) case of the Appin Murder<sup>8</sup>.

Stevenson's interest in Scottish history was both personal and professional. However, as highlighted in Dossena (2010), he was writing for an audience of non-specialists, and could even afford to introduce anachronisms for the sake of poetic effect. For instance, in *Kidnapped* (ch. 26) Alan Breck whistles a few bars of 'Charlie is my darling' as a sign of recognition, though at the time of the action the song had not been written yet.

---

<sup>6</sup> As a matter of fact, travel conditions were much less idyllic, especially for steerage passengers – see [www.gjenvick.com/Steerage/index.html](http://www.gjenvick.com/Steerage/index.html); this and all the other sites mentioned in this essay were last accessed on 13/6/2016.

<sup>7</sup> See [www.stevensonway.org.uk/home.aspx](http://www.stevensonway.org.uk/home.aspx).

<sup>8</sup> This occurred on 14 May 1752, when Colin Campbell of Glenure, or 'the Red Fox', as he was nicknamed, the Government-appointed Factor to the forfeited estates of the Stewart Clan in North Argyll, was shot in the woods of Lettermore. Al[1]an Breck Stewart, who was the chief suspect, managed to flee, and James Stewart, or 'James of the Glen[s]' was arrested and tried as an accessory to the murder by a jury consisting mostly of people belonging to Clan Campbell. On 8 November 1752, James was hanged in chains near Ballachulish, and his body was then left on the gallows for eighteen months, as a gruesome warning to other potential 'rebels'. He died protesting his innocence, and Clan Stewart has allegedly never revealed the name of the actual shooter. On the historical background and academic studies of the case see Hunter (2001), MacGrigor (2002), Gibson (2003 and 2007) and Holcombe (2004). This intriguing story has also been taken up by Nimmo (2005), while, most recently, the media have reported that the case may have been solved, identifying the murderer with Mungo Campbell, the victim's nephew: see [www.bbc.com/news/uk-scotland-glasgow-west-36498517](http://www.bbc.com/news/uk-scotland-glasgow-west-36498517) and [www.heraldscotland.com/news/14550937.The-Appin-Murder-new-study-casts-suspicion-on-a-Campbell-not-a-Stewart/](http://www.heraldscotland.com/news/14550937.The-Appin-Murder-new-study-casts-suspicion-on-a-Campbell-not-a-Stewart/). For an illustration of the trail on a multimedia platform see *Kidmapped*, [www.timwright.typepad.com/kidmapper/](http://www.timwright.typepad.com/kidmapper/).

In the so-called 'age of feeling', Jacobitism and its aftermath were very likely to be appealing topics. Both Jacobite risings failed on account of very serious strategic mistakes on the part of Jacobite leaders. In addition, after the defeat of Culloden, Charles Edward Stuart fled back to France, virtually abandoning his supporters to the revenge of the Hanoverian troops and government. However, what had a much greater impact on the public, especially in the nineteenth century, was the romanticised story of the prince's journey 'Over the Sea to Skye' and his escape as 'Betty Burke', Flora MacDonald's maid. Even to this day, the man whom Hanoverians called 'the Young Pretender' is normally remembered as 'Bonnie Prince Charlie', a label in which both the hypocoristic suffix in the name and the familiar, not without emotional connotations, overtly Scots qualifier contribute to the phonaesthetic traits of the phrase<sup>9</sup>.

Indeed, over the twentieth century 'Bonnie Prince Charlie' has become a household name for huge numbers of visitors to Scotland, although their knowledge of Scottish history might be sketchy; the popularisation has even been stretched to the point that a scene evoking the meeting of the prince with Flora MacDonald is found on shortbread boxes<sup>10</sup>. As a matter of fact, the fascination with the Jacobites still persists at all levels: a recent newspaper article announcing an exhibition at Traquair House presented it as being about 'a Jacobite rebel who made a daring escape from the Tower of London shortly before he was due to be executed 300 years ago'<sup>11</sup>, where the adjective 'daring' adds a romanticised connotation to the piece, especially since the 'daring escape' by definition is that of Charles Edward Stuart himself.

On the other hand, the drama of historical events, especially concerning battles, has survived for centuries in popular lore, though in such narrations historical accuracy is of course much less of interest than the heroic figures and deeds narrated or perhaps (re)constructed in them. As we saw above, oral history can rely extensively on song and poetry: the works of Robert Burns, Alasdair McMhaighster Alasdair, and Lady Nairne have coexisted with less literary compositions which circulated widely as ballads sung and sold in the street. Today's audiences can get an idea of what these

---

<sup>9</sup> On the other hand, diminutive forms could be used sarcastically, as in the Jacobite song referring to the British king as 'The wee, wee German Lairdie' – see Dossena (1998).

<sup>10</sup> See [https://pbs.twimg.com/profile\\_images/522416192351256577/sv04HKFi.jpeg](https://pbs.twimg.com/profile_images/522416192351256577/sv04HKFi.jpeg) and [www.telegraph.co.uk/foodanddrink/11217838/Walkers-Is-this-Britains-best-shortbread.html](http://www.telegraph.co.uk/foodanddrink/11217838/Walkers-Is-this-Britains-best-shortbread.html).

<sup>11</sup> See [www.scotsman.com/lifestyle/heritage/new-exhibition-to-tell-of-daring-jacobite-escape-1-3841096](http://www.scotsman.com/lifestyle/heritage/new-exhibition-to-tell-of-daring-jacobite-escape-1-3841096).

materials looked like thanks to 'The Word on the Street', a digital collection of nearly 700 prints and broadsides testifying to the importance of visual culture already at this point in the history of political controversy<sup>12</sup>.

The idealisation of the Jacobite saga is epitomised in what is perhaps the best-known tune to have been associated with the Young Chevalier's escape, 'The Skye Boat Song', based on a Gaelic air, but first published in 1884 (and actually re-written by Robert Louis Stevenson in his *Songs of Travel*, of 1895)<sup>13</sup>. What has long been seen as a traditional Jacobite song is in fact a literary artefact in which the contribution of popular culture is restricted to the tune, while the lyrics are the product of highly educated authors. A similar phenomenon is seen in other Jacobite songs<sup>14</sup>, such as 'Charlie's my darling', or 'Will ye no come back again', authored respectively by James Hogg<sup>15</sup> and Lady Nairne. The creation of these songs and pibroch tunes, many of which sounded like ordinary love ones, but which (often barely) hid a political message, helped that 'invention of tradition', in which the Jacobite cause was reinterpreted as a Highlands vs. Lowlands, Scotland vs. England, opposition, while in fact loyalties were much more divided.

Propaganda also relied on another very popular text type, i.e. 'dying speeches'. These were short pamphlets or broadsides in which the condemned generally (though by no means always) acknowledged their crimes and the justice of the sentence they were about to face, repented of their sins, and exhorted audiences to lead morally irreprehensible lives. While convicts about to be executed could be supposed to be truthful, the reliability of these accounts can actually be questioned, especially when political overtones colour the statements, and may thus have been emphasised for argumentative purposes. In addition, speeches could be interspersed with anonymous commentary, such as we see in the following instance, taken from the *Proceedings of the Old Bailey*, in which both discourse types occur:

---

<sup>12</sup> See <http://digital.nls.uk/broadsides/subject.cfm/key/Jacobites> and [digital.nls.uk/74466725](http://digital.nls.uk/74466725). See also Dossena (2013).

<sup>13</sup> The popularity of the song is still such that it was adapted for Season 1 of the Starz tv series *Outlander*, where it was the title theme ([www.starz.com/series/outlander](http://www.starz.com/series/outlander)).

<sup>14</sup> Useful studies of Jacobite songs are provided by Donaldson (1988) and Pittock (2009).

<sup>15</sup> Indeed, in 1817 James Hogg compiled a collection of Jacobite songs (*The Jacobite Relics of Scotland*, Edinburgh, Blackwood, 1819) on commission from the Highland Society of London.

*'Tis (almost) three centuries since. Linguistic explorations in The Lyon in Mourning*

At a proper pause in prayer, being each asked if they had any thing to say to the spectators by way of warning, Lewis spoke to this effect: "This dreadful sight will not, I believe, invite "any of you to come here by following my example, but rather to be warned by me. I am "but twenty-three years of age, a clergyman's "son, bred up among gentlemen. This wounds "me the deeper; for to whom much is given, "of him the more is required. My friends, I "intreat you all, avoid such offences as may "bring you here, for every cause, and especially for the sake of your family. Let the memory of my evil actions die with me, and do "not reflect on my aged father. Hitherto I "have been a disgrace to all who know me. "Were I to begin life again, I should live an "honour to society.

He still denied that he intended to kill the prosecutor, but only shot at his horse; (which has been remarked on before) yet confessed his life was justly forfeited to the laws of his country."

Hannah Dagoë, being asked, still denied she was guilty of the fact she died for, but owned she had often before deserved to be brought here. Being again warned not to persist in a denial of that fact, she owned she was concerned in it, but said no more.

Mr. Rice was silent except in prayer, wherein he was fervent.

[www.oldbaileyonline.org/browse.jsp?id=OA17630504&div=OA17630504&terms=jacobite#highlight](http://www.oldbaileyonline.org/browse.jsp?id=OA17630504&div=OA17630504&terms=jacobite#highlight)

Besides, dying speeches were not always entirely original; some phrases recur, which may suggest that they were edited and somehow standardised prior to circulation; in the 'dying speech of James Shepheard: who suffer'd death at Tyburn, March the 17<sup>th</sup>, 1717-18' (<http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:HLS.Lib:912616>) some expressions echo the ones that are also found in the 'Last Speech of Coll Oxburgh, Who was Executed at Tyburn MAY 14<sup>th</sup>, 1716':

In the first Place, I declare I die a Member of the Holy Roman Catholick Church, tho' a very unworthy One; and I desire all the Members of that Communion, to assist my Soul with their charitable Prayers.

<http://digital.nls.uk/broadsides/broadside.cfm/id/15257/transcript/1>

Among the documents collected in *The Word on the Street* we find 'The Last Speech and Confession of Thomas Bean, one of those Executed for the late Riot in Salisbury Court at London', a broadside dated 1716; the convict,

who is a member of the Church of England, attributes his behaviour to religious zeal, and challenges the lawfulness of the sentence:

I AM brought hither by GOD'S Permission, Dear Fellow Christians and Countrymen, against the ancient Laws of this Kingdom, and the undoubted Liberties of this once Free People, by virtue of a new pretended Law, to suffer an Ignominious Death, tho' nothing worthy of Death, even according to this new Constitution, could have been prov'd upon me, had I had but the Right of defending my self allow'd me, which we Englishmen have hitherto so much glory'd in, and for which we ordinarily appeal to GOD and our Country, as I do most solemnly now appeal to both, in this my last Hour. [...]

It was the Zeal that burned in me to hear of certain Diabolical healths publicly drunk in Defiance of all Law, as well as Religion, and particularly of Confusion to the Church of England, with Hellish Reflections both on the Living and the Dead, which kindled that Fire in me which would have been hard for Men of more Years and Understanding, to have govern'd under such great and repeated Provocations. [...]

I Die an unworthy Member of the Church of England, as by Law Establish'd which GOD for ever preserve, and I protest against Popery and all Antichristians whatsoever, and all Usurpation both in Church and] State.

(<http://digital.nls.uk/broadsides/broadside.cfm/id/15606/transcript/1>)

Dying speeches thus reinforced beliefs through the voices of protagonists who were about to leave this world, but who generally confirmed their religious and political allegiances, stating that their hopes were in any case for the greater good of the country. As we will see, also in LM the contributions of witnesses play a crucial role in the representation of facts and opinions, as their validating force relies on the presupposed truthfulness of the utterance. While this may seem circular, Speech Act Theory clarifies that it is in fact an aspect around which communication revolves, as the presupposition of truthfulness underpins all exchanges, and it is in this light that instances of texts in LM will be discussed.

### **3 The Lyon in Mourning**

In the edition under discussion here, LM presents nearly 600 documents of varying length in three volumes; in each volume a preface is present, in which the editor, Henry Paton, of the Scottish History Society, provides background notes on the collector, i.e. Robert Forbes, Bishop of Ross and



Caithness, and the papers themselves; these are not arranged chronologically according to the times of the events to which they refer, but follow the order in which Forbes collected them<sup>16</sup>. So as to facilitate readers, the nineteenth-century editor provided a 'Chronological Digest of the Narratives and Papers printed in the "Lyon"' as an Appendix to Vol. 3. Another Appendix to Vol. 3 is the 'Narrative by John MacDonald' of the 'true and real state of Prince Charles Stuart's miraculous escape after the battle of Cullodden' [sic], reprinted from *Blackwood's Magazine*, October 1873, and preceded by a letter in which George Skene, who transcribed it, stresses its reliability:

[EDINBURGH, *September 9, 1873.*

SIR,—The Manuscript narrative of the escape of Prince Charles Stuart, by John Macdonald, one of his companions, of which a copy follows, is the property of the Misses Macdonald of Dalilea, grand-daughters of the author, and was intrusted to me by them. I have transcribed the MS. carefully, *verbatim et literatim*, and have merely added an introduction and conclusion, partly from information I already possessed, and partly from that furnished to me by the family. Of the authenticity of the MS. itself I have not the shadow of a doubt. (LM 3: 375)

The great attention paid to reliability had actually featured very prominently also in Forbes's statements in the Preface, where the importance of first-hand accounts is highlighted, both for the sake of truthfulness and for the sake of posterity:

I have,' [...], 'a great anxiety to make the Collection as compleat and exact as possible for the instruction of future ages in a piece of history the most remarkable and interesting that ever happened in any age or country.' [...] 'I never chuse, he says, to take matters of fact at second-hand if I can by any means have them from those who were immediately interested in them.' Where this could not be obtained, he instructed his correspondents to 'have a particular attention to dates, and to names of persons and places;' for, he adds, 'I love a precise nicety in all narratives of facts, as indeed one cannot observe too much exactness in these things. . . . I love truth, let who will be either justified or condemned by it. . . . I would not wish to advance a falsehood upon any subject,1 not even on Cumberland himself, for any consideration whatsoever.' (LM 1: xiv-xv)

---

<sup>16</sup> Background notes on the history of the collection are at [www.nls.uk/about-us/publications/discover/2009/lyon-in-mourning](http://www.nls.uk/about-us/publications/discover/2009/lyon-in-mourning).

As for the title, it may be easy to assume that it refers metaphorically to Scotland's royal coat of arms, on which a red lion rampant is depicted. However, the first document in the collection is a copy of a letter dated 23<sup>rd</sup> October 1746, sent by Robert Lyon, incumbent of the Episcopal Church in Perth, to his mother and sister. This is followed by Robert Lyon's dying speech, dated 28<sup>th</sup> October 1746, and other documents concerning both him and other people executed at the same time. The title thus proves interestingly evocative and potentially polysemous.

### **3.1 The structure of the work**

As far as contents are concerned, the collection is not entirely about 'a certain young gentleman', as Charles Edward Stuart was called, although as many as 44 documents refer to the prince in their titles. Other leading figures in the rebellion also feature quite prominently, such as Arthur, Lord Balmerino, about whom we find 8 documents. In fact, almost 300 documents are letters or extracts from letters exchanged between participants in the events and between Forbes and his informants. In addition, the collection comprises several other text types; among these, we have 24 *accounts*, 23 *narratives*, 22 pieces of poetry (13 labelled *verse* and 19 *lines*), 3 *songs*, 12 *speeches* (including 2 clearly labelled as *dying speeches*), 16 *conversations*, 16 *journals*, 3 lists of *evidences*, 2 *anecdotes*, and 2 *cases*. Finally, the preface describes some objects added to the collection:

First, there is a piece of the Prince's garters, which, says Bishop Forbes, 'were French, of blue velvet, covered upon one side with white silk, and fastened with buckles.' Next there is a piece of the gown worn by the Prince as Betty Burke, which was sent to Bishop Forbes by Mrs. MacDonald of Kingsburgh. It was a print dress, and from this or other pieces sent the pattern was obtained, and a considerable quantity of print similar to it made by Mr. Stewart Carmichael, already mentioned. Dresses made from this print were largely worn by Jacobite ladies, both in Scotland and England, for a time. Thirdly, there is a piece of tape, once part of the string of the apron which the Prince wore as part of his female attire. Bishop Forbes secured this relic from the hands of Flora MacDonald (LM 1: xviii)

The 'relics', as the text aptly calls them, have such a high symbolic and affective value that, in the case of fabrics, their patterns are reproduced and worn wherever possible. Besides, their authenticity is stressed by the

reference to the people who provided them. This strategy is actually quite frequent throughout the collection, as documents are often attributed to specific and clearly identified sources – see the following instances:

A genuine and full account of the battle of Culloden, etc., taken from the mouths of the old laird of MacKinnon, Mr. Malcolm MacLeod, etc., and of Lady Clanronald and Miss Flora MacDonald, by John Walkingshaw of London, or Dr. John Burton (LM 1: 66)

Journal of the Prince's embarkation and arrival, etc., taken from the mouth of Aeneas MacDonald, a banker in Paris, and brother of Kinlochmoidart, when he was in a messenger's custody in London, by Dr. Burton of York  
(LM 1: 281)

Journal taken from the mouth of Flora MacDonald by Dr. Burton of York, when in Edinburgh (LM 1: 296)

Copy of several remarkable narratives taken from the mouth of Dr. Archibald Cameron's lady, by Dr. John Burton, when in Edinburgh  
(LM 1: 307)

Factual details, however, merge with poetic accounts in which love and death coexist in emotional strains. It is the case, for instance, of the 'Lines on a young lady, who died on seeing her lover, Mr. Dawson, executed on 30th July 1746':

As the fair martyr her dear lover saw  
Lie the pale victim of inhuman law,  
His gen'rous blood distilling all around,  
And life, swift ebbing, thro' each crimson wound;  
It seemed as if from mortal passion freed  
She blest his death, for honour doom'd to bleed.  
But when, high-raised, she saw the panting heart,  
Now let thy handmaid, Heav'n! she cried, depart.  
Be Judge, O Thou, whose ballance sways above!  
Receive our souls to pardon and to love!  
At once she burst the feeble bonds of clay,  
And her free soul, exulting, springs away.  
To endless bliss, they issue, out of pain.

One moment separates, and joins again.

(LM 1: 241)

A footnote clarifies that the young lady did not actually witness the execution, but saw its outcome, hence her mortal sorrow.

### **3.2 The language of Appraisal**

Given the breadth, heterogeneity, and complexity of the documents under discussion, questions arise as to the theoretical approaches that may best enable us to study them. In particular, as the object of this investigation concerns the construction of reliability, no simple corpus-driven approach may be taken to discuss individual items in the texts. Although it might be straightforward to discuss frequencies of evidentials and personalisation strategies, a more complex approach may be in order: expressions of shared views, evaluations, and insider's comments imply subjectivity, which it may be useful to discuss on the basis of Appraisal theory (see Martin and White 2005 and White 2007 and 2015).

This approach appears to provide a comprehensive and accurate framework for the study of phenomena in which the interaction of semantics and pragmatics is particularly important. The tools of Appraisal theory enable the investigation of style and stance in such a way that the linguistic construction of authorial voices and textual personae may be studied, in the presupposition that all texts interact with one another, no matter how implicitly or explicitly, and respond to one another with the expression of Attitude (i.e., emotional or affectual responses), Engagement (i.e., acknowledging, ignoring or rejecting different view-points, for instance employing evidentiality, concessive forms and presumptions), or Graduation (i.e., strengthening or downtoning statements or their semantic focus). In particular, expressions of Attitude comprise three sub-systems: Affect (relating to emotion), Judgement (relating to the implicit or explicit evaluation of behaviour with respect to social norms), and Appreciation (relating to the evaluation of objects).

In LM all these aspects are seen to be expressed alongside one another, and though these phenomena may be studied individually, focussing on micro-details, such as lexical choices, or syntactic features like use of modal auxiliaries and personal pronouns, this would leave us with a very narrow view of textual organisation and pragmatic significance. Before that step is taken, therefore, a more comprehensive approach is required,

identifying the main patterns at work by means of close reading of the documents and through an overall qualitative investigation.

As the different text types present in the collection are taken into consideration, it is immediately clear that, as we saw above, song and poetry are privileged tools for the expression of Affect, whether this relates to a positive or negative emotion – i.e., whether the lines are in praise of an event or a person, or a lament, again for an event or for somebody's death; see the following instances: one is an ode on the birthday of 'the Old Chevalier', while the other is the beginning of a lament on Culloden, in which the use of Latin is perhaps in line both with the elevated register it is meant to employ and with the religious overtones that many documents evoke when 'martyrdom' is mentioned or implied:

The birthday of the Prince's father, the Old Chevalier, or as the Jacobites called him, King James the Eighth.

*UPON THE TENTH OF JUNE, 1747.*

Let universal mirth now rear its head,  
And joy, exulting, o'er the nation spread.  
Let all this day forget each anxious fear,  
And cease to mourn the ills which Britons bear—  
This day, which once auspicious to our Isle,  
Did all its long expecting hopes fulfil,  
Gave to the world Great Britain's glorious heir,  
Th' accomplishment of vows and ardent pray'r.

(LM 1: 233)

Lament on Culloden

Ah ! quantam tolero solitudinem  
Per prærupta vagans culmina montium,  
Per saltus varios, per cava rupium,  
Ericeta per aspera.

*Ah! How I struggle  
Wandering through the rugged  
peaks of the mountains,  
Through various cliffs, on through  
the hollow in the rocks,  
and the rough heather.*

*(my translation)*

(LM 2: 38)

Dying speeches, instead, as we saw above, combine Affect with Judgement and Engagement; at the very emotional time when they are presented, they also evaluate the sentence, the political situation, and confirm or disavow the commitment (i.e., the engagement) of their authors.

Judgement is equally prominent in narratives, where events are summarised and then personal comments are provided, as in the instances below:

Ordering all officers, civil and military, [...] to search all suspected houses in the Canongate, Leith, and the other suburbs of Edinburgh, and to seize the persons of such as they shall find dressed in tartan gowns and white ribbands, and the persons of all such as they shall find attending such meetings or dancings, and to make them prisoners, etc.

‘Given at Edinburgh, this twentieth day of December, in the year, etc.  
etc. etc.

*(Sic subscribitur)* AND. FLETCHER.’

When I had read this order, I could not help laughing, and Morgan said, it deserved no other treatment; for he believed never was an officer sent upon any such duty before, as to enquire into the particular dress of ladies, and to hinder them to take a trip of dancing, etc. [...] Mrs. Jean Rollo, an old maiden lady in the Canongate, and sister of the present Lord Rollo, was the only prisoner according to order, and was brought before the Justice Clerk and Lord Albemarle, and after some very silly trifling questions being asked about her tartan gown she was dismissed. (LM 2: 111)

Upon the same day the party was detached to put to death all the wounded men in and about the field of battle, there was another party detached under the command of Collonell Cockeen, to bring in the Lady M’Intosh, prisoner, from her house at Moy. Tho’ Cockeen himself was reckoned a most discreet, civile man, yet he found it impossible to restrain the barbarity of many of his party, who, straggling before, spared neither sex nor age they met with; so that the lady has told many that she herself counted above 14 dead bodies of men, women, and children ’twixt Moy and Inverness. (LM 2: 189)

Finally, letters show their value as ego documents in which point of view is expressed, evaluations are offered, and commitment is confirmed. Usage is of course self-monitored, not least because letters could be intercepted, and great caution is always encouraged:

COPY of a Paragraph of a LETTER (dated February 28th, 1749) [...].

You will oblige me much by transmitting to me by some sure private hand (and not by post) what you mention. And if you would increase the obligation by giving me all that consists with your own knowledge, and all that you can have well vouched from others I will deem it as the greatest favour you can do me. Be as minute and circumstantial as possible, even though the narrative should take up several sheets. I know I can rely upon your veracity, and therefore it is that I am so earnest upon the subject. Take time and perform it with the utmost exactness. Pray remember me kindly to my friend and brother Mr. Hay and his family, and tell him I long very much to hear from him. Perhaps he may find out a private bearer when you intend to write me. You'll understand my meaning well enough.

ROBERT FORBES. (LM 2: 249)

Instances of spontaneous usage are especially remarkable in documents in which phonetic spellings are found, and this also bears witness to Paton's accuracy in handling his sources, as editorial interventions could be assumed to have occurred there; the following quotation is an example:

COPY of the LETTER [...], directed thus: To Mr. RANALD  
MACDONALD of Beulffinlay, by Inverness.

*Newry in the north of Ireland, 1749.*

DEAR SIR,—The bearer, Mr. M'Neile, tells me that your alive and well. I assure you that I never did anything in all my life that gives me more pleasure then the thoughts I have of beeing a mains of saveing your life. I hope you never will bee consernd in another rebellion. [...]. I intend settleing within two mills of Antrim. One Mr. O'Neile, a gentleman of a good fortune and a friend of mine, has 'promis'd me a lace [lease], and I hope on good terms, and I must do my best tho' I cant say I under[stand] much of farming. So I now must turn my sword into a plougshare. (LM 2: 341)

#### **4 Concluding remarks**

A well-known Scots proverb says that 'facts are stubborn chieils', and the frequent reference to factuality in the titles of the pieces collected in LM indicates that the documents were actually left to 'speak for themselves'; the protagonists are not introduced, except in footnotes provided by the nineteenth-century editor, so knowledge about them is presupposed. This contributes to the creation of an in-group in which selected, possibly

confidential material is disseminated and this strategy helps enhance solidarity in the awareness that what is at hand concerns shared dangers, tragic events, and shared political convictions.

While a quantitative investigation would highlight the microdetails of the linguistic choices made in the documents, and might well be the object of future studies, what has been of greater interest here is the kind of patterns that appear to emerge. In this light, Appraisal theory may provide adequate tools for the study of varying text types. The legacy of LM certainly goes beyond its being a witness to troubled times: it also allows us to see how argument and narrative, fact and opinion, could coexist and facilitate both the acquisition of new knowledge and the reinforcement of network ties across time and space.

## References

### Primary source

Forbes, Robert (compiler) 1746-75. *The Lyon in Mourning*, ed. by Henry Paton for the Scottish History Society (1895-96), <http://digital.nls.uk/print/transcriptions/index.html>.

### Secondary sources

Beal, Joan C., Carmela Nocera and Massimo Sturiale (eds.) 2008. *Perspectives on Prescriptivism*. Bern: Peter Lang.

Calloway, Colin G. 2008. *White People, Indians, and Highlanders. Tribal Peoples and Colonial Encounters in Scotland and America*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Clyde, Robert. 1994. *From Rebel to Hero: The Image of the Highlander, 1745-1830*. Edinburgh: John Donald.

Cruickshank, Janet and Robert McColl Millar (eds.) 2013. *After the Storm: Papers from the Forum for Research on the Languages of Scotland and Ulster triennial meeting, Aberdeen 2012*. Aberdeen: Forum for Research on the Languages of Scotland and Ireland, [www.abdn.ac.uk/pfrlsu/volumes/vol4/](http://www.abdn.ac.uk/pfrlsu/volumes/vol4/).

Donaldson, William. 1988. *The Jacobite Song. Political Myth and National Identity*. Aberdeen: Aberdeen University Press.

Dossena, Marina. 1998. 'Diminutives in Scottish Standard English: A Case for Comparative Linguistics?' *Scottish Language* 17: 22-39.

– 2005. *Scotticisms in Grammar and Vocabulary*. Edinburgh: John Donald.



*'Tis (almost) three centuries since. Linguistic explorations in The Lyon in Mourning*

- 2010. 'Reading with Murder: Stevenson's *Kidnapped* and the Popularisation of Scottish History'. In Locatelli (2010): 57-76.
  - 2013. "'And Scotland will march again". The Language of Political Song in 19th- and 20th-century Scotland'. In Cruickshank and Millar (2013): 141-65.
- Gibson, Rosemary M. 2003. *The Appin Murder: In Their Own Words*. Edinburgh: National Archives of Scotland.
- 2007. 'Review of Ancient Animosity: The Appin Murder and the End of Scottish Rebellion'. *The Scottish Historical Review* 86/2/222: 346-47.
- Holcombe, Lee. 2004. *Ancient Animosity: The Appin Murder and the End of Scottish Rebellion*. Bloomington, IN: Author House.
- Hunter, James. 2001. *Culloden and the Last Clansman*. Edinburgh: Mainstream.
- Locatelli, Angela (ed.) 2010. *The Knowledge of Literature IX. Literature and History*. Bergamo: Bergamo University Press.
- MacGrigor, Mary. 2002. *Grass will not Grow on my Grave: The Story of the Appin Murder*. Dalkeith: Scottish Cultural Press.
- Martin, James R. and Peter R.R. White. 2005. *The Language of Evaluation. Appraisal in English*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Murdoch, Alexander. 2010. *Scotland and America, c. 1600 – c. 1800*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Nimmo, Ian. 2005. *Walking with Murder. On the Kidnapped Trail*. Edinburgh: Birlinn.
- Östman, Jan-Ola and Jef Verschueren (eds.) 2007. *Handbook of Pragmatics Online*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins, [www.benjamins.com/online/hop](http://www.benjamins.com/online/hop).
- Pittock, Murray G.H. 2009. *The Myth of the Jacobite Clans: The Jacobite Army in 1745*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Richards, Eric. 2007. *Debating the Highland Clearances*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Sorensen, Janet. 2000. *The Grammar of Empire in Eighteenth-Century British Writing*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Tieken-Boon van Ostade, Ingrid (ed.) 2008. *Grammars, Grammarians and Grammar-writing in Eighteenth-century England*. Berlin: De Gruyter.
- White, Peter R. R. 2007. 'Appraisal'. In Östman and Verschueren (2007): *sub vocem*.
- 2015. *The Appraisal Website*, [www.grammatics.com/appraisal/](http://www.grammatics.com/appraisal/)